

### https://doi.org/10.23913/ride.v13i25.1240

Artículos científicos

# Recomendaciones para la tutoría académica en tiempos de contingencia

*Recommendations for Academic Tutoring at the University Level During the COVID-19 Pandemic* 

## Recomendações para tutorial acadêmica em tempos de contingência

Salvador Ponce Ceballos Universidad Autónoma de Baja California, México ponce@uabc.edu.mx https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0454-9853

Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez Universidad Autónoma de Baja California, México jorge.martinez43@uabc.edu.mx https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8833-5600

Israel Moreno Salto Universidad Autónoma de Baja California, México israel.moreno.salto@uabc.edu.mx https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6705-591X



Revista Iberoamericana para la Investigación y el Desarrollo Educativo ISSN 2007 - 7467

#### Resumen

A causa de la contingencia por la covid-19, la tutoría académica, al igual que otras funciones de la docencia, repentinamente tuvo que migrar a la modalidad no presencial. Diferentes voces han expresado sus posturas sobre el desarrollode estos programas.Ydentro de estas opiniones resulta fundamental identificar recomendaciones que los tutorados hacen para futuras emergencias académicas que impliquen la suspensión presencial de este tipo de servicios. Este artículo presenta los resultados de un ejercicio investigativo que tuvo como objetivo caracterizar, desde la óptica de tutorados de una universidad pública de México, la forma en que podría desarrollarse este proceso ante posibles nuevas contingencias. El abordaje es de tipo descriptivo, apoyado en análisis de contenido. Participaron 5300 estudiantes de diferentes programas de licenciatura. Los resultados muestran un conjunto de 12categorías asociadas a distintas recomendaciones para una tutoría en tiempos de contingencia. Se destaca que la mayoría de las recomendaciones se orientan a mantener una comunicación entre el tutor y los tutorados, así como el uso de diversas herramientastecnológicas que pueden utilizarse durante el proceso de tutoría.

Palabras clave: covid-19, educación superior, tutorías.

#### Abstract

Due to the COVID-19 contingency, academic tutoring, like other teaching functions, suddenly had to migrate to the non-face-to-face modality. Different voices have expressed their positions on the development of these programs. And within these opinions, it is essential to identify recommendations that mentees make for future academic emergencies that imply the face-to-face suspension of this type of services. This article presents the results of a research exercise that aimed to characterize, from the perspective of mentees from a public university in Mexico, the way in which tutoring could be developed in the face of possible new contingencies. The approach is descriptive, supported by content analysis. 5300 students from different undergraduate programs participated. The results show a set of 12 categories associated with different recommendations for tutoring in times of contingency. It is highlighted that most of the recommendations are aimed at maintaining communication between the tutor and the mentees, as well as the use of various technological tools that can be used during the tutoring process.



Revista Iberoamericana para la Investigación y el Desarrollo Educativo ISSN 2007 - 7467

**Keywords:**COVID-19, higher education, tutoring.

#### Resumo

Devido à contingência da covid-19, a tutoria acadêmica, assim como outras funções docentes, de repente teve que migrar para a modalidade não presencial. Diferentes vozes se posicionaram sobre o desenvolvimento desses programas e, dentro dessas opiniões, é fundamental identificar as recomendações que os tutores fazem para futuras emergências acadêmicas que impliquem a suspensão presencial desse tipo de serviço. Este artigo apresenta os resultados de um exercício de pesquisa que teve como objetivo caracterizar, a partir da perspectiva de tutores de uma universidade pública do México, a maneira como esse processo pode ser desenvolvido diante de possíveis novas contingências. A abordagem é descritiva, apoiada pela análise de conteúdo. Participaram 5.300 alunos de diferentes cursos de graduação. Os resultados mostram um conjunto de 12 categorias associadas a diferentes recomendações de tutoria em momentos de contingência. Ressalta-se que a maioria das recomendações visa manter a comunicação entre o tutor e os orientandos, bem como a utilização de diversas ferramentas tecnológicas que podem ser utilizadas durante o processo de tutoria.

Palavras-chave: covid-19, ensino superior, tutoriais.

Fecha Recepción: Enero 2022

Fecha Aceptación: Julio 2022

## Introduction

The 2019 coronavirus disease (covid-19) pandemic has generated or exacerbated multiple social problems, particularly in the fields of economy, health, education, among others (Enríquez and Sáenz, 2021; Giroux, 2020; Gutiérrez, 2020). Regarding the education sector, and as a result of the social distancing actions promoted by national and regional governments at the beginning of the pandemic, educational services migrated from face-to-face to emerging and distance education with the support of various technological resources (International Institute for Higher Education in Latin America and the Caribbean [Iesalc]-United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization [Unesco], 2020).

According to Iesalc-Unesco (2020), in the international arena, the main problems that higher education has been facing in times of pandemic have had to do with the lack of teachers prepared to conduct distance learning processes, low connectivity to the Internet in





the homes of students and professors, as well as the marginalization and desertion of university students. Similarly, Calderón, González and Torres (2021) point out that there have also been problems related to the difficulties in managing virtual platforms and the absence of spaces for students to carry out professional practices. Regarding Mexico, Cortez, Moreno and Valladares (2021) highlight the emotional difficulties that higher education students have suffered, which, in turn, have had negative effects on their academic performance.

Considering the current context generated by the covid-19 pandemic, and in order to seek to provide care at crucial moments to higher level students, one of the important services that had to migrate from face-to-face to distance learning was that of academic tutorials (Díaz, 2021). From the point of view of the National Association of Universities and Institutions of Higher Education [Anuies] (2000), tutorials are defined as a service of accompaniment and support provided by the teacher individually to the student in order for them to face their problems. and adapt to the university environment, meet their academic objectives and face the commitments of future professional practice (Anuies, 2000). Currently, and according to de la Cruz (2017), every institution affiliated with Anuies has a tutoring program.

Authors such as Martínez, Pérez, González, Gonzálezy Martínez (2020) and Tejada and Arias (2003) argue that academic tutoring is important in the university context, since through this service the student can be offered support in their transition to college. labor market and encourage reflection on the professional project. Similarly, it can be ensured that students achieve school success, a crucial element for achieving educational quality in the university context (Martínez et al., 2020), as well as being a bridge to achieve the relevance and equity of the educational process (Narro and Arredondo, 2013).

The foregoing, according to de la Cruz, Chehaybary Abreu (2011), can be seen as clearly remedial actions of a school nature in higher education, since, following these authors, the promotion of professional development is still pending in the tutoring work. of students located in real contexts. However, Narro and Arredondo (2013) emphasize that tutorials should not be seen as simple institutional policies or as a mechanism to accompany students in the acquisition of disciplinary and professional knowledge, but rather that they should promote the integral development of the people in various walks of life.





Regarding the health contingency due to covid-19, Angulo and Urbina (2021) comment that tutoring in university spaces has regained its importance as it is a means that makes it possible to address the consequences of the health emergency in educational matters with the student population, such as socio-emotional situations, economic and technological problems, among others. Obviously, the very functioning of the tutorials has been altered as a result of the context of the health emergency that we are currently experiencing. Higher level educational institutions, with the intention of continuing to provide tutorial actions, have resorted to the use of various technological tools such as Zoom, Microsoft Teams, Google Meet, as well as social networks such as Facebook or WhatsApp (Díaz, 2021; Yucra, 2022).

It should be noted that, in empirical studies carried out with university students and professors, it has been agreed on the importance of reinforcing those mechanisms that make it possible to improve communication between tutor and graduates with the intention of providing student support, guidance and orientation in times of pandemic. in times of academic uncertainty (Angulo y Urbina, 2021; Calderón *et al.*, 2021; Yucra, 2022).

As happened with face-to-face classes, during the pandemic the tutoring service had to migrate to the distance modality. This is not new, since, previously, with the aim of providing support to students throughout their university journey, institutional efforts had already been made to transfer the tutoring service to the virtual sphere, either as a mechanism for give attention to those who attend their training process in a distance modality or as a space for asynchronous communication between tutor and tutored (García, Cuevas, Vales and Cruz, 2012; Romero and González, 2013).

It is also important to point out that, regardless of whether the tutorials are face-toface or remote, their purpose remains the same, namely, that both students and teachers present their problems and seek solutions that guarantee the success of the educational process (Duggleby, 2001). However, according to what García et al. (2012), tutorials carried out virtually come to represent a certain advantage compared to those carried out in person, since it is possible to interact remotely from different places, which allows students to organize the time allocated to this activity.

The functions of the tutor range from the academic to the motivational. For this reason, it must generate an environment of trust and empathy so that students feel real accompaniment, through synchronous and asynchronous interactions, both to reaffirm the





knowledge they have already acquired and to resolve any doubts that arise. throughout their academic career (Angulo and Urbina, 2021; García et al., 2012; Yucra, 2022). And even more so within a health confinement such as the one caused by covid-19, where situations of a socio-emotional nature arise that require a greater degree of academic support (Angulo and Urbina, 2021).

This article documents the results of a research exercise that aimed to characterize, from the perspective of university tutors from a public university in Mexico, the way in which tutoring could be developed in the face of possible new academic contingencies. Mainly, it is integrated by the detailed description of the method and the results, as well as a broad and solid discussion, to finally present the conclusions.

## Method

An exploratory approach was proposed (Merriam and Tisdell, 2015). And it was supported by content analysis based on free comments from students (Charmaz, 2006). This is due to the fact that the health contingency due to covid-19 represented an unprecedented scenario and open approaches could better pay for initial explorations.

The main objective was to characterize, from the perspective of university tutors from a public university in Mexico, the way in which tutoring could be developed in the face of possible new contingencies that imply the face-to-face suspension of educational services, this from the experience of participating in academic tutoring during the contingency for the covid-19.

## **Participants**

5,300 undergraduate students from a public university in Mexico who had an academic tutor assigned during the 2020-1 school year (February to June 2020) participated. Of these, 3,180 are women and 2,100 men; 40 preferred not to identify with any gender. The selection of the participants was for convenience, that is, all those who answered the questionnaire completely.

Table 1 shows the distribution of the participants by area of knowledge, taking into account the seven areas in which the study plans of the institution where the study was developed are organized. In addition, table 2 shows the distribution by semester of the students.





Área de conocimiento	Estudiantes participantes	Porcentaje
Ciencias Administrativas	1219	23 %
Ciencias Agropecuarias	106	2 %
Ciencias de la Salud	795	15 %
Ciencias Naturales y Exactas	159	3 %
Ciencias Sociales	1325	25 %
Educación y Humanidades	583	11 %
Ingeniería y Tecnología	1113	21%
Total	5300	100 %

## **Tabla 1.** Distribución de participantes por área de conocimiento

Fuente:Elaboración propia

es	Porcentaje
	19 %
	20 %
	12 %
	11 %
	8 %
	9 %
	8 %
	9 %
	3 %
	1 %
	100 %

#### **Tabla 2.** Distribución de participantes por semestre

Fuente:Elaboración propia





#### Instrument

The electronic questionnaire to collect the data, called the Survey on academic tutoring during the contingency, was constructed ad hoc, based on the study objectives. It was submitted to the review and discussion of three specialists in academic tutoring. The resulting consensus leaned towards a structure of open questions, given the importance of collecting all the expressions in the face of an unprecedented scenario such as the covid-19 health contingency. The structure of the instrument incorporated identification data (sex, semester and study career) and two central open questions: 1) "How was the experience of accompanying your tutor during the academic contingency?" and 2) "What would you recommend so that tutoring in contingency periods like the one we are experiencing works properly?" This second question is the main source of the study presented here.

## **Process and analysis**

The survey was sent to all 55,000 undergraduate students at the study institution. It was applied throughout the month of June 2020 and a response was obtained from 10,140 students. These responses were preliminarily reviewed in order to identify that they were complete. Finally, 9,497 responses were valid for processing.

In the first place, the indicators referring to the study career, sex and semester were obtained, which made it possible to generate statistical data.

Now, for the recommendations regarding the development of tutoring in future academic emergencies, these 9,497 were initially considered, however, after filtering expressions unrelated to the objective of the research, a total of 5,300 were finally obtained to be analyzed.

Based on these answers, a first classification reading was carried out to place them in the elements of the classic structure of a training process or didactic act (teacher, method, content and resources). Once this was done, they were adapted for the tutoring process in the following way: a) Tutor profile, b) Method or development of the tutoring, c) Content of the tutoring and d) Resources for the development of the tutoring. This structure was established with the intention of better organizing the results, always taking care not to alter the meaning of the students' answers.





Once the comments were located in any of the previous elements, the coding proceeded. This was carried out manually, with the support of contingency tables in electronic format. As it was an exploratory investigation and with few previous studies on the phenomenon under study, an inductive exercise was chosen (Saldaña, 2015). This allowed the coding and categorization of each of the comments, and resulted in a first version of the codebook. Afterwards, a second review was carried out which, based on minimal adjustments, allowed for the final version of the book. Table 3 shows the main contents of said book.





Tabla 3. Contenidos del libro de códigos sobre recomendaciones para la tutoría en

Componentes	Criterios	Códigos
Perfil del tutor	Cualidades-	Paciente
	actitudes	Comprometido
		Respetuoso
		Empático
		Motivador
	Conocimientos	Procesos institucionales relacionados con la
		emergencia académica
Desarrollo de la	Formato	Calendarizada
tutoría		Clase formal
		Citas específicas
		Presencial (de acuerdo con las posibilidades
		de la contingencia)
	Tipo de	Individual
	sesiones	Grupal
	Comunicación	Continuidad de la tutoría
		Disponibilidad del tutor
		Respuesta oportuna por parte del tutor
	Seguimiento	A dudas de alumnos
		A procesos académicos
		A problemas de alumnos
Contenido de la	Diagnóstico	Condiciones de los alumnos por la
tutoría		contingencia
		Condiciones de los alumnos previas a la
		contingencia
	Continuidad	Información real, clara y continua
	de servicios	Proceso educativo
		Trámites escolares

contingencias académicas





	académicos y	Actualización de información
	trámites	
	Salud	Emocional
		Física
	Modalidad a	Estudio a distancia
	distancia	Uso de la plataforma institucional
		Uso de herramientas tecnológicas
Recursos para el	Herramientas	Videoconferencia
desarrollo de la	tecnológicas	Llamada telefónica
tutoría	sincrónicas	Chat
	Herramientas	Correo electrónico
	tecnológicas	Plataformas educativas
	asincrónicas	Facebook e Instagram
		Foros virtuales

Fuente: Elaboración propia

Table 4, for its part, presents an example of one of the codes that make up the book of recommendations for tutoring in academic contingencies.





Categoría	Herramientas tecnológicas sincrónicas
Definición de la categoría	Aborda lo relacionado con las herramientas tecnológicas
	asíncronas que se pueden utilizar para el desarrollo de la
	tutoría a distancia, ejemplos: videoconferencia,
	videollamada, chat, mensajería instantánea, etc.
Código	Videoconferencia
Definición del código	Cuando se propone la videoconferencia como herramienta
	para desarrollar la tutoría a distancia.
Reglas de codificación	Codificar las expresiones que señalan que la
	videoconferencia o herramientas afines sirven para
	desarrollar la tutoría a distancia. Ejemplos pueden ser
	videollamada, videoconferencia u otras que impliquen el
	mecanismo de imagen en vivo.
Ejemplo de código	"Tener videoconferencias, algún tipo de chat del grupo con
	el tutor, para estar más cerca del tutor" (M-35-3-4RA1).
	Fuente: Elaboración propia

Tabla 4. Ejemplo de un código sobre la categoría herramientas tecnológicas sincrónicas

Fuente: Elaboración propia

To proceed to the final description of the results, a random reading of sections of the database was previously used as a confirmation strategy, following the coding rules established in the codebook. (Glaser y Strauss, 1967).

## **Results**

This section presents the four components of the training process described in the method section. Within each of these, the categories and codes are described.

## **Component 1. Tutor profile**

This component includes two categories: qualities and attitudes of the tutor and knowledge of the tutor.

Thus, based on the comments of the students, it was identified that among the qualities and attitudes that tutors should have in an emergency process should be patience, commitment, respect, empathy and the ability to motivate students. : "I would recommend that tutors be patient, since being far away implies a lot of misinformation for everyone" (M-25-7-1P1).





"Assign competent tutors who have a real commitment to their work." (M-2-2-1P1). "Respect of the tutors with the students. For example, about the agreed hours" (H-54-5-1P1). "In the case of my tutor, nothing. In the case of other tutors that my colleagues have told me about, it would be good to be more empathic with the students. Also, show interest in them in this pandemic" (M-10-4-1P1). "A bit of motivation so as not to feel tense due to the current problem that we are all experiencing" (H-1-7-1P1).

Regarding the knowledge of the tutor, the importance of knowing all the institutional processes related to the contingency and being able to solve the doubts of the students about these topics was expressed: "You must know everything that the faculty will do for the pandemic to be clear about what to do" (H-45-5-1P2). "A lot of information is confusing: I think tutors should give us clear and true information about what is done at the university to continue with classes" (M-89-6-1P2).

## **Component 2. Development of tutoring**

This component includes four categories that reflect the development of the tutoring process: format, type of sessions, communication and monitoring.

First, regarding the format, the students suggested that the tutoring take place in a formal class; that is, not precisely in a particular session, but that it is part of their academic load. Similarly, they indicated that the sessions with the tutor must be previously defined with date and day, that is, scheduled: "In the same way that a class is given: it can be by video call or platform" (H-45-5 -2DT1). "Set dates and times and connect with students on time" (H-40-6-2DT1). "Make a calendar with specific dates for tutoring and be able to communicate or see each other" (M-98-7-2DT1).

They also mentioned that the specific citation format to deal with a topic can be used, but they are more inclined towards a formalized structure. "Help by appointment, according to what the students need or what the tutor wants to tell us" (H-45-5-2DT1).

Some students indicated that the tutoring should combine virtual and face-to-face sessions, not without taking measures to avoid the risks that arise due to the contingency: "Do the tutoring in person, by appointment and with a very small number of people, but many days (M-88-1-2DT1).





Regarding the type of sessions, the second category of the component, most of the comments were oriented towards the preference for individual sessions; others less so, due to the group option. "Meetings or appointments with the tutor should be individual and group, but more individual due to the issues that one wants to present" (H-97-5-2DT2). "Meetings with the tutor as a group help everyone to be on the same page. I think they are a good option" (H-45-5-2DT2).

The third category of the second component is communication. This one had the highest overlap of comments. They expressed that, in the face of a contingency process, the continuity of services, such as tutoring, must be communicated; that is, to communicate if the tutoring will continue to be given "That they notify that the tutoring will continue to be given" (M-18-6-2DT3) "That the tutor identifies herself to know that she is there, that they be present. We didn't know anything about her for a long time and we had to look for her" (H-101-7-2DT3).

Within the same category, it was identified that, during the tutoring process, it is important that the tutor shows availability, which implies that he is in contact with the students, is attentive to the needs they present and communicates continuously." Maintain continuous contact between students and tutors: no, sometimes yes and then nothing" (M-41-7-2DT3). "At least to know how they are, because they don't tell us or warn us anything" (H-63-1-2DT3). "In some cases, that he be more attentive to the requests and requirements of the students" (M-14-6-2DT3). "That they be aware of their students, to identify them and provide them with support if they require it" (H-8-2-2DT3).

Similarly, in the communication category, students expressed the importance of a timely response from tutors, especially during a contingency period where everything is uncertain. This includes the timely resolution of doubts and the response to requests made by students, whether to deal with a topic, carry out a procedure or schedule meetings, are part of the above: "That it is about responding in time to the doubts we have , by whatever means is defined" (M-9-3-2DT3). "More communication and quick response, because maybe it's an emergency about the school, a meeting, paperwork or things like that" (M-55-5-2DT3). "That they be attentive to the requests that we make as students, since it could be something serious in an emergency and they do not answer us" (H-98-1-2DT3).





On the other hand, the fourth category of the component alludes to the continuity of the tutoring development. In this, the students expressed the importance of being followed up during the semester, mainly in the following three processes: 1) how they are doing in their classes, particularly because the contingency involved moving to the online modality 2) what is related to the academic procedures, since many of the services were suspended or migrated to a non-face-to-face format, and 3) student doubts.

That a tutor be assigned per group instead of individually, to facilitate the monitoring of the development of online classes and solve problems effectively and on time; with weekly group sessions or in a designated period, to see in a group and individual way how classes and other procedures are being carried out (M-99-5-2DT4).

"Schedule virtual accompaniment appointments with each tutor for the procedures that must be fulfilled by the students or those that cannot be done and know how due to covid" (H-3-4-2DT4). "They must make sure that the doubts are resolved and that the student does not keep more, because the tutor does not ask again" (H-13-5-2DT4). "A strategy that can work is that the tutor gives us answers to the doubts and then, at the same time, reviews them; she can also make a forum where common doubts are resolved for all of us who have them" (M-6-1-2DT4).

### **Component 3. Tutorial content**

This third component is made up of four categories associated with the content or information that the tutor must provide or develop in tutoring during a contingency such as the covid-19 pandemic: the importance of preparing a diagnosis of the students' situation, what concerns the continuity of the academic services and procedures carried out by the institution, the health of the students and, lastly, the distance modality.

In relation to the diagnosis, the students underlined the importance of identifying the needs of the students due to the health contingency; that is, what they possibly need or the problems they face. Likewise, they indicated that, regardless of the contingency, there are students who already had some difficulty (even registered), so it is also important to identify them to support them in time. "Make sure we know if we all have the necessary services for this type of thing (computers, Wi-Fi, etc.)" (M-75-3-3CT1). "Perhaps seeing records of students who had a special situation, such as emotional or economic problems, since, although I did not





have them, perhaps some classmates did and they should receive help on time" (H-63-4-3CT1). "Locate colleagues who are already known to be ill and help them in time, because they already have problems, more so than those of us who have just started with classes on the platform" (M-36-4-3CT1).

In the category of continuity of academic services and procedures, the students mentioned that all the information provided by the tutor must be clear and truthful, not lead to confusion. This is because, in a contingency scenario, certainty and clarity are extremely important to provide certainty. They also indicated the need for the tutor to continuously communicate the changes that occur during the contingency. "Simply clear and real communication to avoid confusion about what the classes, the practices, the service will be like" (H-7-4 -3CT2)."They say one thing and then another. The tutors must inform. Sometimes, they did not know things that we already knew or that other colleagues from other careers told us" (H-70-3-3CT2). "I think that the tutor should send information continuously about the possible changes or what is happening at the university due to the pandemic: that gives us more relief, because sometimes we get confused and it is even scary" (M-91-5- 3CT2).

In this same category, it was identified that it is important to report on how the educational process will be developed based on distance work, as well as support services for students, such as counseling, tutoring, scholarships and educational guidance. In addition, the importance of receiving information on academic-administrative procedures, such as reregistration, payments, social service, professional practices, among others, was mentioned. "When there are problems with distance classes, the tutor must know where to go for questions of platforms, teachers or materials that they do not give us" (H-26-4-3CT2). "You can clearly report on the tutorials and advice that they give us to some students, because we don't know. We only have contact with the subject teachers and sometimes we don't even know when the class will be" (M-25-7-3CT2). "That they inform very clearly and that they say if they are going to give scholarships or what the re-registration process will be like" (H-79-3-3CT2).

In addition to the above, it is important for students that the information is constantly updated and changes are notified, since contingency scenarios are uncertain and changes can occur suddenly. "Give a statement or announcement every time changes occur. or update of





the information in accordance with the progress of the covid-19 in the faculty" (M-83-4-3CT2).

With reference to the category of health, this is valued as transcendental, especially due to the situations that a pandemic can cause both at home and at school. The issue of health is considered physically and emotionally. The students proposed guidance to receive information or attention on how to avoid contagion and on emotional problems such as anxiety and depression, which can be caused by isolation and remote work, and to give special attention to students who have manifested this type of problem. "Give a lot of information or tell us where they help us on issues of how to avoid contagion" (M-18-1-3CT3)."I think it is very important, during periods like this, to keep a watch on the mental health of the tutors, since for some people isolation can be an unpleasant experience" (M-20-3-3CT3). "Emotional help for people with problems of anxiety, depression, etc., both for those who already have them or those who are given through online classes" (H-52-2-3CT3). "Enable sessions or recommendations on the situation of contingency to take care of ourselves at home, at school and in our families" (M-19-3-3CT3).

As the fourth and last category of the third component, the distance modality is located, which points to the information that the tutor can provide about the implications of this type of scenario. In particular, the students indicated that it is important to be provided with information on how to work or improve their skills for remote work, how to use the institutional educational platform and technological tools. "Not all of us knew how to study alone at home and learn, that is important to teach students, because it is not easy to be without a teacher" (M-10-7-3CT4). "That clear information be provided on where to learn or how to use the class platform: not everyone knows because they had not taken online courses before" (H-9-5-3CT4). "Because working with platforms and remotely involves more things, not just the platforms, for example, Meet, Zoom, shared Drive files, making videos, it is important that we are guided how to learn, sometimes not even the teachers know" (M-73-4-3CT4).





### **Component 4. Resources for the development of tutoring**

This component is integrated by the tools that the students propose for the tutoring to take place in scenarios that imply the suspension of face-to-face activities. His views were oriented toward both asynchronous and synchronous technology tools.

The first category has to do with synchronous technological tools. From the opinion of the students, these play an important role in the development of tutoring. Above all, they opted for those that allow closer contact with the tutors, being able to see or hear them: videoconference, chat or by phone. The latter was little mentioned in the comments, but was also proposed. "Have videoconferences, some type of group chat with the tutor, to be closer to the tutor" (M-35-3-4RA1). "I would like them to be more interactive, either by video call or a group chat; it is good to see and listen to each other" (M-69-6-4RA1). "That a videoconference be created at a specific time to be able to ask any questions you have and that the response be faster" (H-13-3-4RA1)."Through individual chats, for closer and more personalized attention"(H-30-7-4RA1)."They could call by phone to give some important information to colleagues who are not located"(H-44- 1-4RA1).

From the category of asynchronous technological tools, the students indicated that they are very important for the development of tutoring, since they allow the contents to be permanently available and to develop activities. Examples of this type of tool are educational platforms and virtual forums, as well as others that allow continuous communication, such as social networks and email. The students proposed groups in social networks where the students and the tutor participate (Facebook, Instagram, WhatsApp). "Having a platform where notices can be published, information queries, etc. "On the university platform, to always have information and materials" (H-3-3-4RA2). "Where the most current and important information is published, be it on Facebook, Instagram, etc." (M-6-5-4RA2). "Send emails and create a group chat with the tutor (either by Messenger or WhatsApp)" (H-73-4-4RA2). "Use social networks such as Messenger or WhatsApp to inform and tutoring sessions by video call" (M-17-5-4RA2). "Maintain communication with their tutors, either by email or a similar platform, sending general information about events of the pandemic and to give instructions" (H-35-4-4RA2).





To close this section, it is considered important to mention the findings associated with the coincidences of the recommendations of the students.

Of the four components, the one with the most recommendations was "Development of tutoring", with 3,637; followed by "Resources for the development of tutoring", with 1656; It is followed by "Content of the tutoring", with 460, and, finally, "Profile of the tutor", with 241.

Regarding the categories, those of all the components, the one that had the most coincidence was communication, since 2,400 recommendations from the students were located in one of the codes of this category. Within this, the availability code of the tutor was the highest, with 1600.

Within the "Resources for the development of tutoring" component, the categories of synchronous technology tools and asynchronous technology tools received almost the same number of recommendations (841 and 815, respectively), according to their codes. However, the video conferencing code, located in the first category of the component, received 770 comments.

Regarding component two, "Development of tutoring", the tutoring format category was one of the ones that received the most recommendations within its codes, a total of 438. Within this, scheduled tutoring was the code with the most recommendations. high frequency of recommendations (176).

## Discussion

This investigative exercise was characterized by three relevant aspects: 1) gather the opinion of students about their experience in the academic tutoring program and, based on this, make recommendations for the development of tutoring in academic emergency scenarios; 2) find the coincidences of the opinions of this high number of students participating in the study; 3) identify specific elements of tutoring that are different from those of a regular process, so that they provide information for future academic emergency scenarios.

In light of the results, for the students the function of tutoring was extremely important during the health contingency. It is interesting to identify that the expressions of the students are oriented towards announcing, from the beginning of the contingency, that the tutoring





service will continue to be available and that it will be continuous, regardless of the format in which it is offered.

Also, based on what was reviewed, it appears that not all tutors supported students or provided tutoring services in times of the covid-19 pandemic. The expressions of the students indicating that they had to look for the tutors, that they did not know anything about them, that the tutors never identified themselves or that they did not offer the service are notorious. These two findings coincide with the position of Romo (2020), who expresses that, in some way, the figure or function of the tutor was not equally activated from the educational institutions to position themselves as a support agent in the contingency by covid-19, despite the fact that they are the ones who, based on their extensive knowledge of the student profile, can contribute a great deal to the strategies designed by the institution.

On the other hand, from a quantitative perspective (based on the number of comments received), communication is considered the most important process that must be ensured in a contingency scenario. In particular, the communication of the tutor with the mentees, since in this way they will be able to accompany them in the different processes that an emergency on a global scale implies. In this regard, the research by McGill, Ali and Barton (2020) identified that effective communication is one of the key processes for the successful development of tutoring.

In addition, it is possible to identify that the knowledge of the tutor about the institutional information that is generated from an emergency situation is very important for the development of the tutoring. Even if it is not a contingency, the tutors must have very clear information of the institutional processes related to the trajectory of the students. This result coincides with what was found in the study by Ghenghesh (2016), who observes that knowledge of the institution's systems and regulations is one of the most significant characteristics of the staff who act as tutors.

In the recommendations of the tutors, it is evident that they are inclined towards a systematized tutoring characterized by planning and scheduling, which in turn allows offering a constant and not improvised service. Studies such as those by Nickow, Oreopoulos and Quan (2020) identify that a systematized tutoring is related to the satisfaction of the tutors. Likewise, Lowes (2020) favors tutoring that avoids incidental interactions and opts for formality. Finally, Ponce, Martínez, Ruelas and Toledo (2022) argue that tutoring in contingency processes does not allow for improvisation.





Another relevant finding is related to the follow-up that should be given to tutors, especially during a contingency process. In the results, the importance of this process both to identify possible problems and to give them the proper follow-up is evident. According to the National Occupational Standards for Personal Tutoring, approved by the Further Education Tutorial Network (2020), tutors must be able to monitor students in terms of various aspects, including academic processes, academic career and problems presented by students.

An important result that has currently been the center of many reflections is that of emotional health, since the pandemic made this element essential in terms of care, since the effects are not only occurring in students, but also in teachers and parents. In this study it was evident that the tutors gave importance to this type of scenario; They highlighted the attention to the emotional health of the student, to provide information, guidance or channeling with specialized instances. This coincides with the research by Carlana and La Ferrara (2021) on tutoring in the context of covid-19. This pair of authors concluded that the tutorial action has positive effects on the tutored both in the development of socio-emotional skills and in psychological well-being. Similarly, Raby (2020) found that among the reasons students approach their tutors is to request help regarding their mental health.

The elaboration of diagnoses by the tutor has also been an important recommendation made by the participants in this study. Point out two aspects: on the one hand, to identify the conditions of the students in the face of the pandemic, and on the other, to locate the student who, prior to the pandemic, already had some disadvantaged condition. Here it is valuable to expose the empathy of the mentees participating in this study with their own peers, regardless of whether or not they themselves suffer from an unfavorable condition. In particular, the pandemic has revealed significant inequalities in terms of academic development, social and economic conditions, as well as access to technology, to name a few. The works of Bacher, Goodman and Mulhern (2020), Engzell, Frey and Verhagen (2020) and Grewenig, Lergetporer, Werner, Woessmann and Zierow (2021), as well as the present study, account for this type of scenario in the current pandemic context.

Finally, asynchronous and synchronous technological tools have been essential in the face of the covid-19 emergency. According to what was analyzed, these have not only been useful for the development of tutoring, but also for other types of functions, such as teaching, for which students mention the importance of their being used and promoted by tutors. In





this regard, Lochtie, McIntosh, Stork and Walker (2018) mention that the use of technology by tutors is a basic skill that they must possess for the proper development of tutoring. For their part, López and Andrés (2020) indicate that not all students are prepared for the use of technologies. identified extensive difficulties, both in the use of tools and in the self-taught training processes.

It is important to analyze the results from a critical and comprehensive perspective, since the students place the tutor as an extremely important figure in their training process, which is why they also sharpen their requests for support in the face of contingency processes, where adequate and timely responses are extremely valuable. Likewise, the conditions provided by the institution are essential for the proper development of tutoring, and tutors from 36 different academic units participated in this study, so the heterogeneity of conditions was probably a preponderant factor for the perception of the tutors.

On the other hand, let us not forget that the academic emergency implied a sudden and accelerated change not only in the tutoring process, but also in the teaching practice, and this meant more investment of time in the design of their classes, since they had to moving to a modality that many had not experienced, in addition to the personal situation that possibly caused effects of various kinds for teachers.

Regarding the limitations of the study, the main one is related to the incipient research results available on academic tutoring in times of contingency. Similarly, the lack of availability of research peers to validate the codebook used for exploration in a broader way.

The high number of participants (5,300), as well as the representation of students from the seven areas of knowledge in which the curricula are located, are identified as strengths. Likewise, another strength is the novelty of the results for the field of tutoring, particularly in contingency scenarios.

In relation to the weaknesses, its exploratory scope can be indicated and that it was carried out in a single institution, for what these results contribute, but from a particular perspective.

## Conclusions

According to the results of this research work, the considerations mentioned in Table 5 should be taken.





Tabla 5. Consideraciones para operar la tutoría en una contingencia sanitaria

- *a)* Definir la estrategia para la operación de la tutoría.
- b) Anunciar a los estudiantes la continuidad u operación del servicio de tutorías.
- *c)* Promover que la tutoría sea formal y continua, de preferencia con base en una calendarización.
- *d*) Establecer una comunicación efectiva entre el tutor y los estudiantes que implique principalmente la disponibilidad del tutor y la respuesta oportuna a dudas o problemas de los estudiantes.
- e) Presentar a los alumnos de forma clara y permanente el plan de continuidad académica que se defina para atender los procesos educativos y administrativos, así como las estrategias que diseñe la institución para atender las problemáticas originadas por la contingencia.
- *f*) Elaborar diagnósticos de la situación de los estudiantes tanto para identificar las condiciones asociadas a la emergencia sanitariacomo para ubicar a los previamente identificados con alguna condición en desventaja.
- g) Dar seguimiento de manera puntual a los estudiantes que presentan alguna necesidad, particularmente poner atención a la salud emocional y a los que se encuentren en condición de desventaja (lo relacionado tanto con esteinciso como con el anterior inmediato se recomienda que sea en articulación con otros actores e instancias educativas, como docentes, orientadores educativos, psicólogos, personal especializado externo, entre otros, de acuerdo con las condiciones dela institución).
- h) Utilizar diferentes herramientas tecnológicas para su operación con base a los objetivos de la tutoría y las preferencias y posibilidades de los tutorados.

#### Fuente: Elaboración propia

These general points on the development of tutoring in times of contingency should not be seen as unique, but should be added to those that tutoring already develops on a regular basis in the models of each institution, that is, they can be activated in the event of a health contingency.

Similarly, it is important to emphasize that the results of this proposal are from the perspective of students in a pandemic scenario, that is, in the face of a particular health process, so for future scenarios it would be necessary to assess the cause for which it is





declared the academic emergency that implies remote work, whether due to environmental, social, labor situations, among others. This cause will play an important role in defining the content and support to be developed by the tutoring. For example, not all academic emergencies involve confinement, or this for such a long time, nor the high number of infections and deaths, which undoubtedly brings with it scenarios of negative social and emotional effects for students, as well as difficulties and loss of learning. , among other extremely important where tutoring can contribute.

Something of the highest priority is to reduce improvisation in contingency scenarios as much as possible. The experience of covid-19 has taught us the value of planning, as well as the importance of acting rather than reacting, so designing strategies for continuity of tutoring today is extremely important, and for this knowledge of the student's profile, the training of tutors and technological equipment will play a fundamental role.

It is expected that, in addition to the contribution to educational research, this work will be a contribution to the field of academic tutoring in the context of academic emergencies. Based on the realities of the institution and the contingency scenario, they can articulate strategies with other services. and educational actors to enable the proper transit of students and in some way mitigate possible effects. It is evident that tutoring is a widely tested strategy to improve education in different aspects. The covid-19 pandemic is still ongoing and its effects on student learning remain to be seen, however, the projections of international organizations and specialists in the field are not very encouraging.

#### **Future lines of research**

It is considered important to continue exploring the tutoring process in different institutions in a context of academic emergency. Knowing the experiences lived during the covid-19 pandemic will surely contribute to a better understanding of the phenomenon, but above all to proposing strategies to strengthen this type of service in the face of future emergencies that imply the suspension of face-to-face educational services. Also, to add to a comprehensive perspective, it is necessary to recover the opinions of students and tutors, as well as other actors involved in this type of process.





#### References

- Angulo, A. J. y Urbina, F. (2021). Implementación y retos de la tutoría integral: indicadores y percepción de estudiantes en tres universidades del norte de México. *Revista Latinoamericana de Estudios Educativos*, 51(3), 201-230. Recuperado de https://doi.org/10.48102/rlee.2021.51.3.393.
- Asociación Nacional de Universidades e Instituciones de Educación Superior [Anuies].
   (2000). Programas institucionales de tutorías, Una propuesta de la Anuiespara su organización y funcionamiento en las Instituciones de Educación Superior. México: Asociación Nacional de Universidades e Instituciones de Educación Superior.
- Bacher, A., Goodman, J. and Mulhern, C. (2020). Inequality in household adaptation to schooling shocks: Covid-induced online learning engagement in real time. *Journal of Public Economics*, 193. Retrieved fromhttps://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2020.104345.
- Calderón, R., González, M. O. y Torres, B. (2021). Percepciones docentes sobre las tutorías en el contexto del COVID 2019. *Revista Psicológica Herediana*, 14(1), 21-28. Recuperado dehttps://doi.org/10.20453/rph.v14i1.4030.
- Carlana, M. and La Ferrara, E. (2021). Apart but Connected: Online Tutoring and Student Outcomes during the COVID-19 Pandemic. Retrieved from https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/232846/1/dp14094.pdf.
- Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing Grounded Theory. A Practical Guide Through Qualitative Analysis.* London, England: SagePublications.
- Cortez, A.A., Moreno, I. y Valladares, M.C. (2021) Lecciones iniciales de experiencias de educación a distancia de estudiantes normalistas durante la COVID-19. En Robles, M., Jáuregui, M., Medina, M. del S. y Quijano, G. (coords.), *Experiencias de investigación y evaluación educativa en contextos virtuales* (pp. 447-464). Colima, México: Puertabierta Editores.
- de la Cruz, G. (2017). Tutoría en educación superior: análisis desde diferentes corrientes psicológicas e implicaciones prácticas. *CPU-e, Revista de Investigación Educativa*,(25), 34-59. Recuperado dehttps://www.redalyc.org/pdf/2831/283152311003.pdf.
- de la Cruz, G., Chehaybar, E. y Abreu, L. F. (2011). Tutoría en educación superior: una revisión analítica de la literatura. *Revista de la Educación Superior*, 40(157), 189-209. Recuperado dehttp://publicaciones.anuies.mx/pdfs/revista/Revista157\_S5A2ES.pdf.





- Díaz, J. L. (2021). Administración de la práctica tutorial en tiempos del COVID-19: Atendiendo las necesidades especiales de los alumnos universitarios a través de la tutoría en línea. *Revista Dilemas Contemporáneos: Educación, Política y Valores,* 8(especial), 1-10. Recuperado dehttp://www.scielo.org.mx/pdf/dilemas/v8nspe1/2007-7890-dilemas-8-spe1-00003.pdf.
- Duggleby, J. (2001). *El tutor online, la enseñanza a través de internet*. Barcelona, España: Ediciones Deusto.
- Engzell, P., Frey, A. and Verhagen, M. D. (2020). Learning Inequality During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *SocArXiv*. Retrieved fromhttps://ideas.repec.org/p/osf/socarx/ve4z7.html.
- Enríquez, A. y Sáenz, C. (2021). Primeras lecciones y desafíos de la pandemia de COVID-19 para los países del SICA.Ciudad de México, México:Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe. Recuperado de https://repositorio.cepal.org/bitstream/handle/11362/46802/1/S2100201\_es.pdf.
- Further Education Tutorial Network [FETN]. (2020). National Occupational Standards for Personal Tutoring. United Kingdom: Further Education Tutorial Network. Retrieved from https://fetn.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/National-Occupational-Standards-for-Personal-Tutoring.pdf.
- García, R. I., Cuevas, O., Vales, J. J. y Cruz, I. R. (2012). Impacto de la tutoría presencial y virtual en el desempeño académico de alumnos universitarios. *Revista Iberoamericana de Educación*, 58(2), 1-11. Recuperado dehttps://doi.org/10.35362/rie5821447.
- Ghenghesh, P. (2017). Personal tutoring from the perspectives of tutors and tutees. Journal of Further and Higher Education, 42(4), 570-584. Retrieved fromhttps://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2017.1301409.
- Giroux, H. (2020). La pandemia de covid-19 está exponiendo la plaga del neoliberalismo.
   *Praxis Educativa*, 24(2), 1-13. Recuperado de https://dx.doi.org/10.19137/praxiseducativa-2020-240202.
- Glaser, B. andStrauss, A. (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Research: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. New York, United States of America: Aldine.
- Grewenig, E., Lergetporer, P., Werner, K., Woessmann, L. and Zierow, L. (2021). COVID-19 and Educational Inequality: How School Closures Affect Low- and High-Achieving





Students. *European Economic Review*, 140, 1-21. Retrieved from https://covid-19.iza.org/publications/dp13820/.

- Gutiérrez, A. (2020). Educación en tiempos de crisis sanitaria: pandemia y educación. *Praxis, 16*(1), 1-4.Recuperado de https://doi.org/10.21676/23897856.3040.
- Instituto Internacional para la Educación Superior en América Latina y el Caribe-Organización de las Naciones Unidas para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura [Iesalc-Unesco]. (2020). *COVID-19 y educación superior: De los efectos inmediatos al día después*. IESALC-UNESCO. Recuperado de http://www.iesalc.unesco.org/wpcontent/uploads/2020/05/COVID-19-ES-130520.pdf
- Lochtie, D., McIntosh, E., Stork, A. and Walker, B. (2018). *Becoming an Effective Personal Tutor in Higher Education*. Nantwich, England: Critical Publishing.
- López, M. y Andrés, S. (2020). Trayectorias escolares en la educación superior ante la pandemia ¿continuar, interrumpir o desistir? En Casanova, H. (coord.), *Educación y pandemia: una visión académica* (pp.103-108). Ciudad de México, México: Instituto de Investigaciones sobre la Universidad y la Educación/Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México.
- Lowes, R. (2020). Knowing You: Personal Tutoring, Learning Analytics and the Johari Window. *Frontiers in Education*, 5(101), 1-11. Retrieved fromhttps://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2020.00101.
- Martínez, P., Pérez, J., González, N., González, C. y Martínez, M. (2020). La tutoría universitaria vista por sus alumnos: propuesta de mejora. *Revista de la Educación Superior*, 49(195), 55-72. Recuperado dehttp://www.scielo.org.mx/pdf/resu/v49n195/0185-2760-resu-49-195-55.pdf.
- McGill, C., Ali, M. and Barton, D. (2020). Skill and Competencies for Effective Academic Advising and Personal Tutoring. *Frontiers in Education*, *5*(135), 1-11. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2020.00135.
- Merriam, S. and Tisdell, E. (2015). *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation*. San Francisco, United States of America: Jossey-Bass.
- Narro, J. y Arredondo, M. (2013). La tutoría. Un proceso fundamental en la formación de los estudiantes universitarios. *Perfiles Educativos*, 35(141), 132-151. Recuperado dehttps://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0185269813718397.





- Nickow, A. J., Oreopoulos, P. and Quan, V. (2020). The Impressive Effects of Tutoring on PreK-12 Learning: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Experimental Evidence. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.26300/eh0c-pc52.
- Ponce, S., Martínez, Y., Ruelas, P. y Toledo, D. (2022). Tutorías académicas durante la contingencia académica por la COVID-19. La óptica de estudiantes de educación superior. Archivos Analíticos de Políticas Educativas, 30(70). Recuperado de https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.30.6852.
- Raby, A. (2020). Student Voice in Personal Tutoring. *Frontiers in Education*, 5(120), 1-9. Retrieved fromhttps://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2020.00120.
- Romero, M. R. y González, C. (2013). Propuesta de tutoría en la educación virtual en el Sistema de Universidad Virtual de la Universidad de Guadalajara, desde la experiencia como asesor. EnRosas,P.y Ramírez, M. A. (coords.),*El impacto de la tutoría en las instituciones de la región Centro Occidente de la Anuies*(pp. 55-64). Guadalajara, México: Universidad de Guadalajara.
- Romo, A. (2020). Los actores faltantes. *Campus Milenio*, (848). Recuperado de https://suplementocampus.com/tienda/campus-848/.
- Saldaña, J. (2015). The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers.London, England: Sage.
- Tejada, J. M. y Arias, L. F. (2003). El significado de tutoría académica en estudiantes de primer ingreso a licenciatura. *Revista de la Educación Superior*, 32(127), 25-38. Recuperado de http://publicaciones.anuies.mx/pdfs/revista/Revista127\_S2A2ES.pdf.
- Yucra, Y. J. (2022). Tutoría universitaria en tiempos de pandemia, una prioridad para los estudiantes del altiplano de Puno. *Revista Historia de la Educación Latinoamericana*, 23(37). Recuperado dehttps://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=8258666.

Rol de Contribución	Autor (es)
Conceptualización	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Metodología	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Software	No aplica
Validación	Salvador Ponce Ceballos "igual" Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez "igual" Israel Moreno Salto "igual"





Análisis Formal	Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez
Investigación	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Recursos	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Curación de datos	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Escritura - Preparación del borrador original	Salvador Ponce Ceballos "igual" Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez "igual" Israel Moreno Salto "igual"
Escritura - Revisión y edición	Salvador Ponce Ceballos "principal" Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez "que apoya" Israel Moreno Salto "que apoya"
Visualización	Jorge Eduardo Martínez Iñiguez
Supervisión	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Administración de Proyectos	Salvador Ponce Ceballos
Adquisición de fondos	Salvador Ponce Ceballos

